

CAPISTRANO BAY DISTRICT  
AGENDA REPORT  
January 30, 2024

---

*Beach Sand Related Business*

## ITEM 7a

### Discussion to Consider Joining the Regional SANDAG Project

- It is important that the District be an active participant in the Regional SANDAG Project
- The fee for participation started at **\$93,905.20**
- Jack and Don worked with the City to reduce our share to **\$50,000**
- The agent from SANDAG and our legal counsel Stan Lampert recommend we take a pass

SANDAG has been the Metropolitan Planning Organization for the San Diego region since before 1996 when I first began managing here at Beach Road. SANDAG understands that to be a truly regional organization, it must expand its territory to include the entirety of the Oceanside Littoral Cell. This is the coastal region that runs from the Dana Point Headlands south to the La Jolla Submarine Canyon near Scripps in San Diego.

The project to which we have an opportunity to take part in is referred to as the Regional Beach Sand Project or RBSP III Project. The following pages go into detail and describe the scope and planning for the proposed project.

The District has been offered the opportunity to join and be an applicant for the SANDAG project and while this sounds like a great opportunity, it has been shown to the Committee, from discussions with our counsel, that because we are perceived as a private beach in the eyes of practically everyone, there is no chance that public grant funding would ever be approved for our short 1.5 mile section of beach. In this scenario, we would spend a lot of money and have nothing to show for it in the end.

Secondly, being an applicant means we would, at some point, have to deal with the CCC with the potential for the CCC to level onerous conditions on the District, as in making our private gate public.

Instead of risking such exposure, it was recommended by counsel that the District pass on joining SANDAG and instead, offer to contribute to the cost being charged to the City for their portion. In the cost proposal shown on the following pages, task 6.2 (that's the City's area) comes to about \$125,000. The District would be better served at this time by being a silent participant and sharing in the City's cost.

After much discussion, the Committee agreed to recommend to the Board that the contribution offer to the City be \$25,000.

## **Regional Beach Sand Project III (RBSP III) Phase I - Preliminary Planning Activities Scope of Work – Amendment 2, Dana Point**

### **INTRODUCTION:**

SANDAG is the Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO) for the San Diego region and plays a key role in the regional coordination of a variety of projects. SANDAG proposes to conduct a feasibility study for a regional beach sand nourishment project. Beach nourishment is being considered as a sea-level rise adaptation strategy by a number of cities in the San Diego region who have updated their Local Coastal Programs to align with the California Coastal Commission's Guidance on sea-level rise. Wide beaches can help protect coastal communities and coastal transportation facilities by acting as a buffer to alleviate some of the impacts from sea-level rise, strong storm events, and high tides. SANDAG has previously completed two regional beach sand nourishment projects in 2001 and 2012 (RBSP I and RBSP II, respectively), adding approximately 3.5 million cubic yards of sand to the region's local beaches. In addition, SANDAG has an established regional forum (the Shoreline Preservation Working Group or SPWG) where elected officials are engaged in regional adaptation projects, such as beach nourishment.

SANDAG has also been in contact with jurisdictions in Orange County on beach nourishment planning efforts, in part because sand transport in the Oceanside littoral cell extends generally from Dana Harbor south to the undersea canyon off La Jolla.

### **RESPONSIBLE PARTIES**

SANDAG has retained a consulting team to complete two deliverables: Feasibility Study (with economic analysis) and Offshore Borrow Site Survey Plan. Generally, SANDAG will be responsible for overall project management and administration and will play a role in coordinating with local jurisdictions as well as drafting and editing the feasibility study. The consultant will be responsible for the majority of other tasks including the review of existing monitoring data, completing the Offshore Borrow Site Survey Plan, completing the Economic Analysis, and finalizing the Feasibility Study.

### **OVERALL PROJECT OBJECTIVES:**

- Identify beach erosion areas in the San Diego region that may impact coastal transportation infrastructure through review of existing data and coordination with coastal jurisdiction staff.
- Evaluate the economic costs and benefits of implementing a regional beach nourishment project and several alternatives to that project that may include one pilot sand retention strategy.
- Complete a Feasibility Study for a future regional beach nourishment project and alternatives, including potential programmatic strategies.

## Exhibit A – Scope of Work

- Identify lessons learned from the past two regional beach sand projects administered by SANDAG and other southern California beach nourishments efforts and identify how to expedite project delivery and minimize project costs compared to prior efforts.
- Create a plan for surveying offshore sand borrow sites to ensure adequate quantities of sand are available to nourish the San Diego region's beaches.

The current scope of work addresses these two deliverables in the San Diego region. Amendment 1 will enact the optional Task 5 to address feasibility of beach nourishment in the City of San Clemente. This Amendment 2 provides scope and funding for similar evaluation in the City of Dana Point (Task 6.1) and an optional location South Dana Point/County Beach (Task 6.2).

### **1. Task 6: Dana Point Nourishment Planning**

The consultant shall review existing documentation from Dana Point and the Orange County Parks to evaluate additional locations for beach nourishment in the City of Dana Point.

#### **Task 6.1 City of Dana Point (Doheny/Capo Beach)**

The consultant shall evaluate one possible location for beach nourishment within publicly owned property south of San Juan Creek, approximately up to 5,000 feet in length, with an estimated total placement volume of up to approximately 500,000 cubic yards (cy). This area is generally Doheny Beach and Capistrano Beach (or Doheny/Capo Beach).

Consultant would revise the table of contents for the Feasibility Study to include information for Dana Point. Information may be integrated into each section of the Feasibility Study or may be a separate chapter of the report. For example, Site Conditions would address Wave Climate (and other topics in Chapter 2) in the San Diego region as a subsection and there would be a new subsection for Dana Point Wave Climate. Other Related Projects (Section 2.6) would be expanded into Dana Point. While the Lessons Learned (Chapter 3.0) would remain largely focused on San Diego, the Recommendations for Efficiencies could consider this new opportunity. If Dana Point were formally a part of RBSP III, then "possible" efficiencies in sharing a dredge would become more certain. Alternatively, the approach to CEQA streamlining may become more complex as decisions would need to be made regarding lead agency or lead agencies. The universe of alternatives would expand so Section 4 would expand as well.

Once defined (based on engineering and marine biology considerations), the project envelope of this general location would be evaluated to generate economic benefits relative to cost (BCA). The methodology for economic analysis would focus on recreational benefits, as is being performed in San Diego County and San Clemente, but new data would need to be collected in Orange County for property value and attendance. Potential benefits to recreational facilities will also be qualitatively evaluated (including public parking and sports equipment/facilities).

No new borrow site evaluations will be completed as those for San Clemente would also apply to Dana Point.

The program management approach would remain as proposed but there would be additional time required to facilitate coordination and communication with a broader group. A kick-off meeting would be scheduled with Dana Point, Orange County Parks and SANDAG staff, with a site visit that same day. Attendees in person will include team members from AECOM, M&N,

## Exhibit A – Scope of Work

Coastal Frontiers, Merkel, and Dr. King The complexity and cost of adding the Dana Point location is minimized if the option is exercised very soon after the Feasibility Study project is kicked off, so for costing purposes we assume the authorization is received in January 2024.

### Task 6.2 South Dana Point/County Beach (District/Poche Beach) – Optional

This optional site is located at the south end of the City of Dana Point, in front of the residences that comprise the Capistrano Bay Community Services District (District) and south to the City's boundary (including Poche Beach). The placement volume is anticipated to be up to approximately 225,000 cubic yards. Once a possible footprint envelope is identified (with engineering and marine biology input) the economic analysis will be undertaken. This receiver site location is largely characterized as private beach in front of residences with a southern extension into public property. The approach to economic analysis will be modified to evaluate both recreational benefits and flood protection benefits. Flood protection/storm damage protection will be addressed using readily available modeling information (e.g., CoSMoS, available FEMA, or similar) and will not be assessed via the USACE methods. The team would also need to address repair strategies for the only public access point at the south end of this site.

Additional project management time is also included in this optional task to facilitate coordination and communication with a broader group. The complexity and cost of adding the south Dana Point/County stretch is minimized if the option is exercised very soon after the Feasibility Study project is kicked off, so for costing purposes we assume the authorization is received in January 2024. We also assume the site visit and kickoff meeting for this length will be held concurrent with the northern Doheny/Capo stretch for cost efficiency.

### **Task 6 Deliverable**

- Task 6.1. Expanded Economic Analysis and Feasibility Study for Dana Point (Doheny/Capo Beach stretch)
- Task 6.2- (Optional) Expanded Economic Analysis and Feasibility Study for Dana Point (District/Poche Beach stretch)

### **Task 6 Assumptions**

- Authorization to proceed received in January 2024 to maximize efficiencies from kicking off RBSP III San Diego region.
- 1 field site visit attended by AECOM (3 staff), M&N (2 staff), Phil King, CFC (1 staff) and Merkel (1 staff).
- Up to 2 alternative receiver sites added to Chapter 4.0 of the Feasibility Study (one south of San Juan Creek (Dohoney/Capo Beach) and one optional site (District/Poche Beach).
- The marine biology information would be based on existing materials from the City and others, no field surveys. The level of detail, extent of coverage relative to the sites, and season collected/age of data is unknown.



**COST PROPOSAL FORM**

Project: TO#1 AMD#2 Phase 1 - Preliminary Planning Activities for RBSP III Consultant: AECOM Technical Services
--

Prime: AECOM Technical Services, Inc.		Labor Hrs	Labor
Task	WBS Description		
6.1	City of Dana Point (Doheny/Capo Beach)	202	\$ 32,390.00
6.2	South Dana Point/County Beach (District/Poche Beach)-Optional	120	\$ 21,936.00
<b>Total Labor:</b>		<b>322</b>	<b>\$ 54,326.00</b>

Subconsultant 1: M&N		Labor Hrs	Labor
Task	WBS Description		
6.1	City of Dana Point (Doheny/Capo Beach)	140	\$ 35,796.00
6.2	South Dana Point/County Beach (District/Poche Beach)-Optional	119	\$ 29,946.00
<b>Total Labor:</b>		<b>259</b>	<b>\$ 65,742.00</b>

Subconsultant 2: Merkel		Labor Hrs	Labor
Task	WBS Description		
6.1	City of Dana Point (Doheny/Capo Beach)	48	\$ 7,488.00
6.2	South Dana Point/County Beach (District/Poche Beach)-Optional	40	\$ 6,240.00
<b>Total Labor:</b>		<b>88</b>	<b>\$ 13,728.00</b>

Subconsultant 3: King		Labor Hrs	Labor
Task	WBS Description		
6.1	City of Dana Point (Doheny/Capo Beach)	85	\$ 14,450.00
6.2	South Dana Point/County Beach (District/Poche Beach)-Optional	125	\$ 21,250.00
<b>Total Labor:</b>		<b>210</b>	<b>\$ 35,700.00</b>

Subconsultant 4: Coastal Frontiers		Labor Hrs	Labor
Task	WBS Description		
6.1	City of Dana Point (Doheny/Capo Beach)	134	\$ 32,710.42
6.2	South Dana Point/County Beach (District/Poche Beach)-Optional	72	\$ 14,533.20
<b>Total Labor:</b>		<b>206</b>	<b>\$ 47,243.62</b>

AECOM & SUB ODC:		Labor Hrs	Labor
Task	WBS Description		
6.1	City of Dana Point (Doheny/Capo Beach)		\$ 1,741.90
6.2	South Dana Point/County Beach (District/Poche Beach)-Optional		\$ -
<b>Total ODC's=</b>			<b>\$ 1,741.90</b>

Task 6.1 AECOM & SUB LABOR & ODC		Labor Hrs	Labor
Task	WBS Description		
6.1	City of Dana Point (Doheny/Capo Beach)	609	\$ 122,834.42
ODC - 6.1			\$ 1,741.90
<b>Total Labor &amp; ODC:</b>		<b>609</b>	<b>\$ 124,576.32</b>

Task 6.2 AECOM & SUB LABOR & ODC		Labor Hrs	Labor
Task	WBS Description		
6.2	South Dana Point/County Beach (District/Poche Beach)-Optional	476	\$ 93,905.20
ODC - 6.2			\$ -
<b>Total Labor &amp; ODC:</b>		<b>476</b>	<b>\$ 93,905.20</b>

<b>Grand Total=</b>			<b>\$ 218,481.52</b>
---------------------	--	--	----------------------